ltem 4c	13/00034/FUL
Case Officer	Nicola Hopkins
Ward	Wheelton and Withnell
Proposal	Erection of an equestrian horse breeding and training facility comprising new stables, tack room and storage. Creation of open dressage arena and associated parking areas
Location	Logwood Stables, Brinscall Mill Road, Wheelton, ChorleyPR6 8TD
Applicant	Mr Stephen Watson & Mrs Rebecca McNair
Consultation expiry:	2 March 2013
Application expiry:	18 March 2013

## Proposal

- 1. The application relates to the erection of an equestrian horse breeding and training facility at Logwood Stables. The applicants intend to operate a stud farm and training centre for the family's privately owned horses. The proposals include the erection of new stables, tack room and storage facilities along with the creation of an open dressage arena and associated parking areas. The applicants currently own 11 horses with 2 foals due this year.
- 2. There have been works which have already commenced on site associated with these proposals including land levelling, laying of hardstanding for access tracks and the erection of stables. Additionally a pond has been created. These elements also require planning permission as they are engineering operations and are subject to a separate planning application. This application (13/00035/FUL) is also on the Committee Agenda.
- 3. The proposals include the erection of building which will measure 45m x 14m (on the site of the former building 1). The building will provide purpose built facilities within this structure, including 6 stables at 3.65m x 3.65m and 4 stables for mares in foal at 4.26m x 4.26m, together with 2no tie bays for veterinary inspections and a solarium/wash box. (The former buildings on the site were used as part of a poultry farm).
- 4. It is also proposed to use part of the site as a riding arena (on the site of former building 2). This will require the removal of the concrete slab. The riding arena will measure 60m x 20m.

#### Recommendation

5. It is recommended that this application is refused.

#### Main Issues

- 6. The main issues for consideration in respect of this planning application are:
  - Principle of the development
  - Traffic and Transport
  - Parking
  - Design

- Public Right of Way
- Lighting and Noise
- Ecology
- Sustainability

# Representations

- 7. **13 letters of objection** have been received raising the following concerns:
  - Since the opening of this business the local public footpaths are being used as bridleways. The hill and the fields around have become absolute quagmire and are now unsuitable as a public footpath.
  - Impact of extra traffic on the private road- this is only sufficient for one vehicle with no provision for overtaking. The resulting vehicles associated with this type of business can vary in size and weight and the safety risks should be paramount when considering this application.
  - Increased danger from additional vehicles and horses using the single track road
  - Impact of new buildings on the countryside
  - The adverse impact through noise, smells and floodlights
  - The applicants have no qualifications to run such a business and have already lost control of their horses on multiple occasions.
  - Works have already been undertaken which are creating flooding problems
  - The idea that this application is going to benefit the community by regenerating this run down farm and creating access to facilities, which are in truth only for a privileged few seems a little farfetched.
  - Scale of the development is inappropriate
  - Would be difficult to police if approved
  - The applicants traffic count is not accurate
  - Vet visit have been missed off
  - Floodlighting has been omitted
  - Overbreeding is a major problem- the applicants are going against the RSPCA and all major equine organisations- the facility is not needed.
- 8. **The owner of Holden Fold Stud Limited** (referenced within the supporting information) objects to the proposals for the following reasons:
  - The British Horse Society recently published an article asking horse owners to think before they breed and called for a halt to breeding in the UK. The situation is of such concern that there is no need for new developments.
  - The RSPCA have seen a growth in horse numbers and have expressed concern and requested a halt over production, breeding and importation of horses in the UK.
  - The horse breeding and achievements sited by the applicant are basic and average in quality. Holden Fold Stud (near Darwin) have semen available for over 20 breeding stallions not only 2 as the applicant claims
  - The absolute minimum qualification from a person offering 24 hour supervision at the standard envisaged would be a Degree in Equine Science, BHS Stage 111 in Care and Stable Management or an NVQ Level 3 in Breeding and Care of Horses. Mr Watson and Mrs MacNair have no equestrian certification.
  - There would be a significant increase in both traffic volume and size of vehicles.
  - The reference to frozen semen within the supporting statement would result to multiple visits from the vets including throughout the night.

- Holden Fold Stud Limited is approximately 5 miles from the site- the claims that this type of facility is not available in the area is not accurate
- There is no evidence to back up the applicants claims to be part of the grand world of equestrian sports
- Mrs MacNair's status is average as an amateur rider and claims within the supporting information are not officially recorded. Her judging aspirations, although admirable, are at the very lowest level and a long way from her national and international aspirations.
- 9. **62 letters of support** have been received setting out the following points:
  - The owner is trying to improve the site which had fallen into a state of disrepair.
  - The works proposed would certainly improve the site and make the access better for runners/walkers alike.
  - Another local business must be a good thing. Given the economic climate investment such as this is a must. In the current economic climate as it is, the locals, councillors and the government should be encouraging new entrepreneurs and ventures in our communities as we are seeing far too many people out of work and business failing.
  - This area has improved considerably with the construction of the equestrian facility as opposed to the dilapidated barns what was there previously.
  - Surely with the recent success of the British Equestrian team at the Olympics and with the focus now on Rio 2016, centres like this are needed to develop and nurture future British talent.
  - The project proposed can only improve the aesthetics of the area for the locals as at the moment the areas to be developed are an eyesore.
  - The proposed application allows the land to be used for what it is intended in the support of animals, in this instance equines.
  - A centre of excellence such as Logwood Stables provides a better vista than that of a broken down ruined old barn that has been there in the past.
  - Agricultural or rural enterprises such as breeding are vastly lacking and so we should be actively encouraging new ventures in this area.
  - There are far too many plans being passed for building sites in the Chorley borough.
  - Any improvement to training facilities and breeding programmes will very much raise the profile of the sport in the north west and would be very much welcome.
  - Why will there be an increase in traffic from current levels when the property is already occupied? The access is suitable and adequate for purpose so there cannot be any argument there.
  - Will provide jobs
  - Will bring a whole new clientele to the area
  - Welcome quality youngstock being available to buy in this area as there is a real lack of this quality of horse not only in the Chorley Borough, but within the North West as a whole
  - It is difficult for everyone involved to keep these top competition horses fit for competition with such limited facilities
- 10. Chorley Ramblers Countryside Officer objects to the proposals for the following reasons:
  - Footpaths Numbers 3, 19 and 21 are adversely affected by this development. The current condition of footpaths 19 and 21 are almost impassable due to weather conditions and increasingly due to the movement of horses.
  - With footpath number 3 there is a road safety issue as commented on by LCC Highways in previously withdrawn planning applications. The access route is very restrictive. Reduction in vehicle movements and size of vehicles is important.

- There will be an increase in midden removal and additional parking within the site.
- The footpaths within the site need to maintained to a sufficient standard to allow the use and enjoyment of the footpaths.
- 11. **Councillor Hansford** has requested that this application be considered at Development Control Committee
- 12. **P Wilson & Company** have submitted an objection on behalf of the neighbours Mr & Mrs J Shacklady. The objections raised are as follows:
  - Where in the proposed building is the solarium/wash box to be positioned? This is mentioned in the planning statement but missing from the proposed floor plans
  - Security lighting and water harvesting has been proposed on the application form; however, there are no details for the siting or design on any plans or in the Planning statement.
  - It is difficult to ascertain from the submissions what area of hardstanding (including turning and parking areas) is proposed. What is existing lawful development and what is existing unlawful development included in the retrospective planning application (App. No. 13/00035/FUL)? Since the applicants purchased the site, large sections of hardstanding have been created. The effect of such on the Green Belt should be considered as part of this application.
  - The six lighting columns on drawing no. 10/055/PO5 Rev E are not included in the planning statement. No assessments have been undertaken on the potential light nuisance these and the security lighting will cause to neighbouring properties.
  - The applicants have stated they currently own 11 horses, two foals due in 2013 and one mare to have a foal by embryo transfer in 2013 (recipient mare therefore required). Only 10 stables are proposed. Where are the remaining horses to be stabled if the applicants intend all horses to be stabled at Logwood Stables?
  - There are multiple references to the applicants' training Paralympic riders and horses. However, the submissions fail to specify how many and where they will travel from.
  - The applicants state *"the farm is run as an agricultural business".* Is the applicants' commercial enterprise selling the horses they breed and/or produce, or the training of other riders and/or their horses?
  - There are now only remnants of the historic buildings on site. The proposed use is significantly different. The proposed development is far larger than the current remnants of the two buildings that once existed on site.
  - The proposed development would entail the construction of new buildings, structures and engineering works (extent to be confirmed) in the Green Belt.
  - The proposed development goes well beyond what is frequently considered (including Appeals) to be essential facilities and the Applicants have failed to demonstrate how that use is one which preserves the openness of the Green Belt.
  - When assessing the impact on openness of the proposed development, we consider that account should be taken of the cumulative effect of the development contained in planning application which includes all existing unlawful hardstanding and proposed hardstanding (App. No. 13/00035/FUL).
  - The applicants have failed; indeed they have made little attempt to justify why the proposed development needs to be sited in this Green Belt location or to demonstrate that no more suitable sustainable non-Green Belt site exists for the facility.
  - Have the applicants been recognised as an important potential contributor for delivering future success in dressage? How does this recent success and increased funding relate to this application?

- 13. The applicant attempts to prove special circumstances however the mere fact that the applicants own the site does not qualify them for very special circumstances. The applicants have come nowhere close to establishing the existence of very special circumstances which might justify this inappropriate development in the Green Belt.
  - The scale, siting and design of the proposed development would be injurious to the visual amenities of the Green Belt; such injury being exacerbated by the external illumination of the riding arena and security lighting, with its resulting light pollution.
  - Topography may help to mitigate the impact on the visual amenity of the Green Belt but the extent of the proposed new building, hardstanding and structures, in the absence of existing buildings of similar or greater size to be demolished, must inevitably have a material and adverse effect on openness.
  - The general noise and disturbance arising from the activities on the Site would impact primarily on the occupiers of Logwood Mill Farm.
  - The development is neither "within an existing building or forms part of a farm diversification scheme"
  - The movement of either horses or vehicles as a result of the development" would prejudice road safety, including that of walkers and other horse riders.
  - It would be extremely difficult to remove any equipment and reinstate the site once its use for horses is no longer required.
  - Brinscall Mill Lane has limited passing bay provision and is therefore unsuitable for any material increase in traffic, particularly that involving horse transporters or vehicles towing horse boxes.
  - The presence of three existing equestrian establishments in the locality mean that the local highway and public rights of way network is subject to regular use by horse riders; albeit that if the Logwood Mill Farm track is a public footpath only, a previous application to upgrade its status to that of a public bridleway having been refused.
  - Why do they state "the only traffic movements being generated would be the horse transporter to deliver the horse and collect at the end of the breeding season"? Why is this required if all horses are in the applicants' ownership?
  - The following traffic movements are not included in the traffic statement:
    - The recommended number of scans carried out by a certified vet for each mare to be put in foal by artificial insemination. The typical average number of ultrasound scans for artificial insemination per mare is 12 (if everything goes to plan) and much more for embryo transfer which the applicants intend to use with one mare;
    - horse inspections prior to gradings;
    - removal of horse manure
    - emergency vet visits
    - transporting semen straws from the Applicants stallions for artificially inseminating mares not within the applicants' ownership. Will semen be collected from the applicants' stallions on site or elsewhere? There are no anticipated traffic movements for either scenario. If semen is to be collected at the application site then where are the facilities for doing this mentioned in the application?
    - training paralympic riders and horses. How frequently will they be using the site?
    - the applicants' trainer. It is normal for a producer of such high performing horses to require onsite training;
  - The applicants clearly intend more external visitors to Logwood Stables than is currently stipulated in the traffic statement.

- It is not acceptable for the applicants to consider the commercial rearing of poultry use that has not existed on site since the year 2000 as a comparison for the proposed development.
- The applicants have no ownership of, or control over, the length of private access road across Logwood Mill Farm, merely a right of way to and from the site.
- The Planning statement states "the view of the stables from the rear of Logwood Mill Farm is screened by a row of conifers to the garden side of the wall that are higher than the ridge of the proposed stables". However, these conifers are in the full control of our clients of Logwood Mill Farm and should not be considered as part of the proposed development landscaping scheme.
- The Applicants fail to specify the hours of opening on the application form.
- The proposed development is contrary to Saved Policies DC1 and EP8 of the Chorley Local Plan Review and SPD entitled 'Rural Development' and NPPF.
- The proposed development would have an unacceptable detrimental impact on the residential amenity of neighbouring properties.
- The additional traffic generated by the proposed development would impair the safety of other users of the local highways and public rights of way network.

## Consultations

- 14. **The Environment Agency** have produced a guidance document which sets out what types of planning consultations the Environment Agency wishes to be consulted. This guidance is based on the Development Management Procedure Order 2010 (DMPO) and current Government planning policy. The Environment Agency does not consider that these proposals fall within the categories set out within the document.
- 15. United Utilities have no objection

## Applicant's Case

- 16. The accompanying Design and Access Statement sets out the following points in support of the application:
  - The current breeding and training programme is carried out at various stables around the country. The intention is to relocate the programme to one site that will accommodate all the necessary facilities for an internationally accredited stud farm and training centre for the family's privately owned horses
  - Mrs McNair has been competing in the Summer and Winter Regional Championships since 2008, competing as part of the North West Senior Team at Inter Regionals and Home Internationals in 2010, 2011 and 2012. Mrs McNair has also achieved great success by breeding and producing the British Equestrian Federation Champion Eventer 2008, 2009 and Reserve 2010.
  - Her experience as a trainer includes training young horses for potential International Young Dressage Horse classes (competed 2010 and 2011), for Burghley Young Event Horse class and training two FEI Paralympic horses and riders for championships and potentially for the 2016 Paralympic Games in Brazil. Mrs McNair hopes to gain a place on the World Class Pathway Scheme with Bolana and Eton UDH. She is also running clinics with World Class Development trainers run through British Dressage, working with Kate Cowell (North West Team Trainer), Stephen Clarke (FEI Olympic Judge 2008, Head Judge for 2012 Olympics, Chief of FEI and President of the Dressage Ground Jury), Emile Faurie (European Gold medallist and 2012 shortlisted competitor) and Maria Eilberg

(travelling Reserve for the World Equestrian Games in Aachen, 2005 and the Beijing Olympics 2008).

- Mrs McNair is currently training to become a British Dressage List 6 Judge which includes ongoing training at the High Profile shows throughout the country
- Due to the nature of equine breeding, there needs to be onsite supervision 24 hours a day.
- The fields are quality pastures maintained to the highest standards being fertile, well watered and free draining. In spring the fields are harrowed and rolled by a local farmer in preparation for the breeding stock, during winter it is proposed to graze sheep on the land to maintain the quality of the pasture.
- For mares requiring more specialist care, it is proposed to have selected nursery paddocks situated close to the property where closer attention and care can be given.
- Due to the quality of horse currently being produced, and looking to produce in the future, all stallion and foaling boxes need to be purpose build units of 4.26m x 4.26m. In addition, the foaling boxes must all be fitted with CCTV cameras
- The proposed development being submitted will aim to provide a breeding and training centre that will be to internationally accredited and Olympic standards.
- The proposed development at Logwood Stables does not fall within the remit of the guidelines as the activities to be associated with this proposal differ considerably from a riding school or livery yard. All horses at Logwood Stables are co-owned by Mrs Rebecca McNair, Mr Steve Watson, Mr Andrew McNair and Mrs Carol McNair
- The horses at Logwood Stables are being bred and trained specifically for Regional, National and International competition, however these events will not take place at Logwood Stables.
- The location at Logwood Stables is extremely well suited to this proposed development. The site is within an area predominantly associated with equestrian activity. The additional 18 acres of land adjacent to Logwood Stables will provide necessary grazing land that cannot easily be supplied in areas outside of the Green Belt. The proposed development is to be focused entirely on the specialised field of Dressage that is proposing to provide breeding and training facilities that will meet international standards.
- This type of facility is not available within Chorley or within the surrounding areas of the region which will bring economic incentives to the area. Economically this will have no detrimental effect on other facilities within the vicinity as the potential market does not conflict with other neighbouring stables and business interests.
- To leave the site in its present derelict state would be detrimental to the Green Belt.
- The proposed development would reduce the impact of the current buildings on the site with the new stable block to be built from modern sustainable materials to a design that is of a building type that is in evidence on many sites within the Wheelton area.
- The proposed development is of such a specialised nature that it does not fall within the categories of the Local Plan and should therefore fall into the remit of special circumstances. The quality and standard of business that the development will promote will bring interest from the European Dressage network that can bring an opportunity for growth to the Chorley area.
- At the Olympics 2012 Great Britain won Gold and Bronze in the Individual Dressage event and Gold in the Team Dressage event. At the Paralympics 2012 Great Britain won 5 Gold, 5 Silver and 1 Bronze medal. At the FEI World Dressage Championship for Young Horses 2012 held in Verden, the event was won by Woodlander Farouche, the first British bred horse to win the event. Whilst Great Britain is amongst the world's best for dressage riders, we have to rely on foreign imports for our horses.

- Mrs McNair is hoping to put Chorley and the North West on the map for British Dressage through breeding and training the horses for the future high profile competitions.
- The opportunity exists for Chorley Council to support a unique business venture and help deliver the development, at no cost to the town, not place barriers in the way of investment.
- The conversion of the existing buildings was never possible beyond the retention of the concrete slab and dwarf walls, due to the amount of asbestos in the roof and walls of the old buildings.
- The bringing together of the activities of the stables within one site will reduce the traffic movements from the site whilst the need to visit the site by local suppliers could be achieved by these suppliers whist making deliveries to the other stables complexes in the area, to accommodate the efficient delivery of goods and supplies.
- If this proposal is to be classified as inappropriate development, where could this standard of development be suitably situated outside of the Green Belt with the amount of grazing land required, that would meet the requirements of the relevant animal welfare and environmental health legislations.
- The volume of the proposed stables would be approximately 50% of the original buildings.
- The breeding business was established in 2007 and registered as Logwood Stables Ltd in August 2010. The proposals as set out will also maintain the environmental quality and countryside character with the agricultural style of the proposed buildings and the use of the land as previously set out.
- The size and scale of the proposed development is appropriate for the standard of business envisaged and the specialist nature warrants its acceptance as special circumstances.
- The proposed use of Logwood Stables is as breeding stables for the breeding of dressage horses of the highest quality. The additional use of the stables as a training facility for horses bred at Logwood Stables will reduce the need to take the horses to another site for training purposes. The training facility will not be typical of the type of riding school, with members of the public attending for regular riding lessons, creating a greater volume of traffic.
- Whilst the development is private, it cannot be classed as small, hence the information provided to justify the special circumstances of the proposals.
- The intent shown by the applicants in relocating to the area and the significant financial input into this venture shows that the proposed development has a long term business plan within its structure.
- The proposed facility at Logwood Stables will be of the highest quality and standards, providing a service that cannot be matched within the Chorley area and the region beyond. The breeding programme will be of an international standard and will promote interest from afar, bringing breeders and dressage horse owners to the Chorley area. The proposed training facility again will bring talent and business to the town with its training to the highest competitive levels.
- 17. The applicant has provided the following points from the British Equestrian Federation (BEF):
  - The British Equestrian Federation (BEF) is the national governing body for horse sports and the principal link with the international federation for horse sport, the FEI. Within BEF's membership are 18 member organisations ranging from sporting bodies such as British Dressage to charities such as the Riding for the Disabled Association. BEF receives funding from UK Sport for elite equestrian sport and funding from Sport England to encourage more people to ride horses and ponies. These funds are then distributed out amongst the BEF's members to help win more medals and get more people in the saddle.

- In order to support this, BEF also has the strategic goal called "Better Horses", and within this are two key objectives, namely "Support better breeding, production, management, welfare and care of horses through education, dissemination of research and knowledge sharing" and "Make the best use of available data to promote appropriate breeding of horses".
- BEF sets out to share information and data in a variety of ways which include the results from the Futurity evaluations to spot talent in young horses destined for top class sport and in the form of its magazine the British Breeder which is full of information on the importance of carefully considered breeding practices. These fall under three headings:
  - a. Do you really need to breed? BEF aims to encourage better breeding, but at the moment, with the economy in downturn, it may be more practical to support existing breeders by buying a good young horse from within the UK.
  - b. If you plan to breed, start with the best mares you can. A mare which has compromised conformation, temperament and competition ability is very unlikely to make a good broodmare. Use available research to identify the best mare lines you can and breed for a specific purpose, have an end goal in mind for your foal and a fully costed business plan to get you there.
  - c. Then you need to choose the best stallion for your mare. Of course he will be approved for breeding with a leading studbook, and if you have done your homework and chosen a sire whose characteristics, athleticism and genetic merit complement your mare, you will be giving your foal the best chance you can for the future.
- The Olympic year of 2012 was one of the most successful yet for British bred horses, which are now beginning to punch above their weight on the world stage. With three British bred medal winners at Greenwich, as well as numerous other placings for British bred horses in the ownership of overseas athletes. We have secured our first double world young horse dressage champion in the form of Woodlander Farouche, numerous victories on the international stage in showjumping, dressage and endurance, and looking to the future, in pony and young rider classes.
- 18. The following additional information has been submitted by the applicant's agent (with reference to the Supplementary Planning Document 3. Rural Development):
  - The employment created by this proposal will be one full time and two part time staff.
  - The proposal is to seek to employ people from the local rural area.
  - This proposal will support a more diverse economic profile that should be supported within the area.
  - In addition to the proposed employment of the proposal, further opportunities will be created to support local businesses selling feed and tack and providing facilities for farriers and vets.
  - The layout of the proposed stables has been specifically designed for breeding, where stallions and mares cannot be stabled within view of each other, or lead a stallion past a mare within the stables. The layout of the stables back to back will achieve this requirement without the need for two buildings.
  - The siting of the building meets the policy requirements as the building is more than 30m from neighbouring residential properties (53m) and is well screened by existing trees.
  - Site treatment for the hard standing and access tracks will utilise the existing slab from the existing building and the tracks that exist around the site. The sand paddock will be sited using the position of the existing smaller building.
  - Highway safety will be greatly increased as the need to move the horses from the site will be reduced from present levels as many of the current movements are due to the facilities not being available at the site. This will benefit both the horses and those using the

existing local roads. There is sufficient turning area within the site for the vehicles to be used without the need to reverse onto the highway.

- Re-use, replacement or extension to buildings in the countryside. The original agricultural use of the building for poultry and egg production ceased approximately 15 years ago. The existing buildings where in a derelict state and due to health and safety grounds it was necessary to remove 60 tonnes of asbestos which formed the walls and roof to both buildings.
- The proposed development will reduce the volume of the existing buildings by 50%.
- 19. The applicant has submitted a Business Plan in support of the proposals which includes the following details:
  - I have already invested in two International quality stallions and five broodmares who have successfully graded within International breed societies.
  - I compete in both National and International classes with a number of these horses to ensure I am using proven stock.
  - I also train several young horses and their riders around the North West region as a fully insured freelance trainer and British Dressage Trainee Judge.
  - What still needs to be done: to convert one of the barns into stables and to remove the other and replace with a 60x20 metre arena.
  - McNair Dressage aims to provide a bespoke service for our customers. Not only will we
    develop International bloodlines not currently available in the UK, but we will also provide
    fresh, chilled and frozen semen from our stallions to National and International customers.
    The only recognised "Stud yards" with this ability in the UK are based in the South. McNair
    Dressage aims to put the North West on the map.
  - Outside the racing industry, the UK fails to consistently produce top level sport horses capable of carrying British riders to success at the highest international level.
  - The primary function of any stud facility is to safely inseminate (usually by artificial insemination or AI) a broodmare with the semen from a stallion who compliments her conformational weaknesses. The mare will carry the foal for an estimated period of 11 months (with regular scans). Once delivered the foal will remain on its mother for six months before "Weaning" where they are separated allowing the mare to be placed back in foal to repeat the process. The now Weanling will be turned out with other youngstock until it reaches its third year. It is backed (taught to be ridden) and trained in preparation for sale. There are various factors during this early lifespan that determine when exactly the horse is sold. There may be an opportunity to sell the foal at weaning or anytime leading up to it being backed. However to maximise the value in the horse it would ideally be backed and paraded at young horse classes before sale. Obviously, this is potentially a long process hence the need for numerous broodmares consistently producing youngstock. The stallions will also be standing at public stud where the fresh, chilled or frozen semen is available for sale.
  - To compete at the very top level, dressage horses can cost upward of £300,000. I am not, nor have I ever been, in a position to spend such a large amount of money on a single horse as is the case for 90% of the competing riders and owners. I have had to invest in young horses and train them to as high a standard as possible before selling on at profit to invest in horses with the potential to go even further.
  - Breeding allows me to select the characteristics and movement I want from a particular horse, for either my own use or for a potential customer to attain success. The vast majority of quality young dressage horses sell for between £15,000 and £60,000.
  - To produce a young horse costs in the region of £3,500 which includes initial insemination costs, vet packages, feed, livery, advertising and in house training.

- The youngstock can be sold at circa £7,000 upon weaning, £15,000 plus as a backed three year old and £25,000 plus as a competing four year old.
- The initial plan is to turnover young horses at weaning and potentially backed for under £10,000 in a bid to have our youngstock out in the market competing on a regular basis generating interest and activity as the business initially develops.
- In the local area there is no business that would be competing for the same customers McNair Dressage is targeting. The businesses in the local area tend to be dealers who we would target anyway or sports horse studs such as Country Farm Stud Limited in Preston (who we currently work alongside) and Holden Fold Stud in Blackburn whose stallions are 17 years plus.
- Realistically, our competition is on a National level, however these dressage studs (and I only refer to those that have both in house stallions and mares) do not have the same bloodlines as McNair Dressage which make our business plan unique.
- The studs which would be our main competition are as follows:
  - Woodlander Stud
     150.7 miles
  - Flax Lion Stud
     204.2 miles
  - Solaris Sports Horses 213.3 miles
  - Glossoms Farm Stud 117.8 miles
- Horse and Hound and Horse magazine are ready to produce an editorial spread as the business opens to promote McNair Dressage as the "One to watch" in British breeding.
- My skills and achievements: Over 15 years of experience with horses and in horse management and welfare. I have successfully bred horses with "Champion" status. I am a fully qualified journalist with numerous contacts at the cutting edge of equestrianism. I have competed at National and International level dressage. British Dressage Trainee Judge
- Potential profit of this venture: £30,000 by year two. £100,000 potential by year fourPlanning Policy

## National Planning Policy

- 20. The relevant national planning policy guidance/statements are as follows:
- National Planning Policy Framework (the Framework)
- 21. The Framework confirms that as with previous Green Belt policy, inappropriate development is, by definition, harmful to the Green Belt and should not be approved except in very special circumstances (para 87).
- 22. The Framework goes on to state that 'when considering any planning application, local planning authorities should ensure that substantial weight is given to any harm to the Green Belt. 'Very special circumstances' will not exist unless the potential harm to the Green Belt by reason of inappropriateness, and any other harm, is clearly outweighed by other considerations.' (para 88).
- 23. Paragraph 89 states that a local planning authority should regard the construction of new buildings as inappropriate in Green Belt. Exceptions to this are:
  - buildings for agriculture and forestry;
  - provision of appropriate facilities for outdoor sport, outdoor recreation and for cemeteries, as long as it preserves the openness of the Green Belt and does not conflict with the purposes of including land within it;
  - the extension or alteration of a building provided that it does not result in disproportionate additions over and above the size of the original building;

- the replacement of a building, provided the new building is in the same use and not materially larger than the one it replaces;
- limited infilling in villages, and limited affordable housing for local community needs under policies set out in the Local Plan; or
- limited infilling or the partial or complete redevelopment of previously developed sites (brownfield land), whether redundant or in continuing use (excluding temporary buildings), which would not have a greater impact on the openness of the Green Belt and the purpose of including land within it than the existing development.

## The Development Plan

- 24. The development plan comprises the saved policies of the Adopted Chorley Borough Local Plan Review 2003, the Central Lancashire Core Strategy 2012 and the North West of England Regional Spatial Strategy 2008 (RSS).
- 25. The starting point for assessment of the application is Section 38 of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 that states if regard is to be had to the development plan for the purpose of any determination to be made under the Planning Acts the determination must be made in accordance with the plan unless material considerations indicate otherwise.

## **Regional Spatial Strategy (RSS)**

26. The Localism Act 2011 gave powers to the Secretary of State to revoke/abolish Regional Strategies. The Chief Planner, in a letter (21 December 2012), has said it is our policy to revoke the existing regional strategies as soon as possible subject to the outcome of the Strategic Environmental Assessment process. The report for the North West Regional Strategy has been published for public consultation. Until such time, RSS remains part of the development plan. Relevant policies within the RSS therefore need to be taken into consideration when determining this application.

# Adopted Chorley Borough Local Plan Review

- 27. The relevant policies of the Local Plan are as follows:
  - GN5 Building Design and Retaining Existing Landscape Features and Natural Habitats
  - GN9 Transport Accessibility and Mixed Uses
  - DC1- Green Belt
  - EP4 Species Protection
  - EP8- Development Involving Horses
  - TR4 Highway Development Control Criteria
  - LT10 Public Rights of Way
- 28. Local Plan Policy EP8 is applicable as it relates to development involving horses. Policy EP8 states:

Planning permission for development involving horses will be granted providing the following criteria can be met:

a. the proposal is of a scale and nature appropriate to the character of the site and the ability of the local environment, including the amenity of local residents, to absorb the development;

- b. in the case of indoor facilities or commercial stables, the development is within an existing building or forms part of a farm diversification scheme;
- c. in the case of small, private developments the site should be close to existing buildings and well screened by existing trees or local landscape features;
- d. the siting, design and materials of the buildings and structures should be in keeping with their surroundings;
- e. the development would not result in the over-intensive use of the local bridleway network;
- f. the movement of either horses or vehicles as a result of the development would not prejudice road safety;
- g. provision is made for removing any equipment and re-instating the site once its use for horses is no longer required.

## Adopted Central Lancashire Core Strategy

- 29. Policies to be given weight are:
  - Policy MP clarifies the operational relationship between the Core Strategy and the National Planning Policy Framework. When considering development proposals the Council will take a positive approach that reflects the presumption in favour of sustainable development contained in the Framework. Planning policies that accord with the policies in the Core Strategy will be approved without delay, unless material considerations indicate otherwise. Where there are no policies relevant to the application or relevant policies are out of date the Council will grant planning permission unless material considerations indicate taking into account Policy MP a) and b).
  - Policy 1 Locating Growth
  - Policy 9 Economic Growth and Employment
  - Policy 22 Biodiversity and Geodiversity
  - Policy 17 Design of new buildings
  - Policy 27 Sustainable Resources & New Developments

## **Supplementary Planning Documents**

Rural Development SPD (October 2012)

## Emerging Local Plan

## Publication Chorley Local Plan 2012 - 2026 (Submission 21 December 2012)

Relevant Policies are:

- ST3: Road Schemes and Development Access Points
- BNE1: Design Criteria for New Development. Criteria a, c, d, f, g and h are relevant to the proposal.
- HW1: New Open Space, Sport and Recreation Facilities.

## **Background Information**

30. The applicants have purchased the property known as Logwood Stables which used to form part of Logwood Mill Farm. The planning history associated with this property and Logwood Mill Farm is set out below. It is clear that any agricultural use at this site has been diluted over time. In the 1980s planning permission was granted to extend the farmhouse into the attached redundant barn and in 2000 planning permission was granted to convert the existing stable into a detached dwellinghouse, this has been purchased by the applicant. The site is now residential in nature although the surrounding area is rural in character the site no longer has the appearance or functionality of a working agricultural unit.

31. The applicants first approached the Council in 2010 at pre-application stage. At this time the applicant was seeking to convert and extend two existing disused farm buildings on the site for horse related development. It is understood that the two buildings were previously used for egg production; however it was clear that this use ceased a number of years ago. The buildings as existed measured:

	BUILDING 1	BUILDING 2	Total
Footprint	900 m²	450 m²	1,350 m²
Volume	3,480 m³	1,370 m³	4,850m³

- 32. The applicants were advised at that time (May 2010) that the principle of the development was unacceptable, the buildings were not capable of conversion and the proposals would not preserve the open and rural character of the Green Belt.
- 33. A site meeting was carried out with the planning officer on 7<sup>th</sup> February 2011 at this time removal of the asbestos roof covering on the buildings was discussed and agreed. Following this site meeting a further pre-application enquiry was submitted in March 2011 for the renovation/ replacement of the existing buildings to create stables/storage building and covered exercise paddock for equestrian (dressage) schooling facility. The former buildings were still present on the site at the time of the pre-application enquiry and the applicant was advised that the scheme as proposed would significantly impact on the openness of the Green Belt and no very special circumstances had been demonstrated. At this time the applicant was advised to consider a reduced scheme.
- 34. In respect of the former buildings as set out above the applicants were advised, during a site meeting, that the roofs could be removed. The applicants have confirmed that once the roofs were removed the structures fell down and as such the structures were removed off site. This application is supported by a letter (this letter isn't dated) from EM Roofing & Sons (who were employed by the applicant to remove the external asbestos cement roof sheets) stating that when the roof sheets had been removed the timber frames started to collapse which they attribute to the main frames only being set into the concrete floor in inch pockets. Part of one of the buildings and the slab for both buildings still remain however the majority of the buildings have been removed off site. The buildings was not previously agreed with the Council. As such this application relates to the erection of a new building and riding arena within the Green Belt.
- 35. This application follows the withdrawal of two previous applications (11/00384/FUL and 11/01103/FUL). The first application was withdrawn as the proposals were considered unacceptable and the agent was advised to withdraw to consider whether a reduced scheme may be more suitable. The second application was withdrawn as the application was considered at Chairs Brief where it was determined the decision could be made under delegated powers. The agent was advised that the recommendation was to refuse the application due to the fact that inadequate justification had been provided and the proposals would be more appropriate as part of a farm diversification scheme. The agent subsequently withdrew the application.

#### Other similar applications in the Borough

- 36. 94/00180/FUL- Roscoe House Farm, Delph Lane, Charnock Richard. Erection of indoor riding area measuring 1540m<sup>2</sup> and 8 metres high. This development represented a commercial horse training business and very special circumstances were demonstrated as the development would assist in the applicant's show jumping career as he was a member of the British show jumping team. Approved July 1994.
- 37. 94/00352/FUL- Lower House Farm, Trigg Lane, Heapey (to the north east of the existing site). Erection of stables ancillary accommodation and construction of sand paddock to form livery business. The scheme included a 21 stable building measuring 345m<sup>2</sup> and 4 metres high. Creation of a sand paddock measuring 25 x 40m. Approved July 1994.
- 38. 03/00608/FUL- Whittle Green Farm, Mill Lane, Charnock Richard. Indoor riding school measuring 888m<sup>2</sup> and 5.4 metre high and 8 stables. Very special circumstances were demonstrated as it involved the relocation, from Oldham, of a sustainable business. Approved October 2003.

### Assessment

### Principle of the development

- 39. The main consideration in respect of this application is the fact that the proposals involve the erection of a new building and riding arena within the Green Belt. The Framework treats such development as inappropriate development unless it relates to one of the exceptions listed above. It is noted that one of the exceptions is 'provision of appropriate facilities for outdoor sport, outdoor recreation and for cemeteries, as long as it preserves the openness of the Green Belt and does not conflict with the purposes of including land within it'
- 40. There is no definitive definition of sport however SportAccord (which is the association for all the largest international sports federations) uses the following criteria, determining that a sport should:
  - have an element of competition
  - be in no way harmful to any living creature
  - not rely on equipment provided by a single supplier (excluding proprietary games such as arena football)
  - not rely on any 'luck' element specifically designed in to the sport
- 41. SportAccord also recognise that sport can be primarily physical (such as rugby or athletics), primarily mind (such as chess), predominantly motorised (such as Formula 1 or powerboating), primarily co-ordination (such as billiard sports) or primarily animal supported (such as equestrian sport). It is considered that dressage falls within the definition of horse riding sports/ equestrian sports for the purposes of this application.
- 42. The breeding of horses does not require planning permission however a building to support horse breeding and training does require planning permission (structures connected with horses do not enjoy permitted development rights as they are not agricultural buildings) and does not fall within the definitions of appropriate development set out above. This use class is sui generis.

- 43. Annex 1 of the Framework states that for 12 months from the day of publication (27 March 2012), decision takers may continue to give full weight to relevant policies adopted since 2004. For policies adopted before 2004, as is the case for the Chorley Borough Local Plan Review which was adopted in 2003, and after this 12 month period, due weight should be given to relevant policies in existing plans according to their degree of consistency with the NPPF.
- 44. Policy EP8 of the Local Plan limits commercial development to development within an existing building or forming part of a farm diversification scheme. The Rural Development SPD (October 2012), which post –dates the Framework and is material to the consideration of this application, states that large-scale developments can rarely be located satisfactorily in open countryside. They are best located within an existing building complex and as part of a farm diversification scheme. Farm buildings which are no longer required for their original purposes are often suitable for conversion to commercial equestrian use, to avoid the need for new buildings which may be intrusive in the countryside. New buildings will only be considered favourably if the proposal relates to the site's main use and if the building is essential to the operation of the business.
- 45. The SPD states: The Councils will require the following criteria to be met in considering applications for developments involving horses:
  - in the case of indoor facilities or commercial stables, the development is within an existing building or forms part of a farm diversification scheme;
  - in the case of small, private developments the site should be close to existing buildings and well screened by existing trees or local landscape features;
  - the development would not result in the over-intensive use of the local bridleway network;
  - the movement of either horses or vehicles as a result of the development would not prejudice road safety;
  - provision for removing any equipment and re-instating the site once its use for horses is no longer required.
- 46. The applicants intentions for the site are noted and it is by virtue of the size of building and arena proposed that the development is considered 'large-scale', a fact which is acknowledged within the submitted supporting documentation. Whilst the proposed use does not fall within the standard definition of livery use (as the stables will not be rented out to individual horse owners for a fee) the proposed number of stables, size of building and size of riding arena significantly exceeds that of a small private facility and as such is considered to be a large scale development.
- 47. The issues in respect of the previous buildings on the site are also noted and it is acknowledged that the Framework allows for the replacement of a building, provided the new building is in the same use and not materially larger than the one it replaces. A building is defined as a *structure with a roof and walls, such as a house or factory*. As the majority of the buildings have been removed/ demolished at the site, contrary to advice given at pre-application stage, the proposed building will not be in the same use as the previous building on site and the fact that the applicant has acknowledged that the previous buildings would not have been suitable for the proposed use the development currently being considered constitutes new development within the Green Belt.
- 48. The proposed building measures 630m<sup>2</sup> and is 4.4 metres high. The building will be constructed out of profiled metal cladding and will constitute the erection of a large building

within the Green Belt. The proposed riding arena measures 60 x 20 metres which is larger than a standard riding manège. It is acknowledged that equestrian facilities can be located within the green belt to assist in sustainable rural development however this needs to be balanced in respect of the size and scale of the development. Whilst the erection of stables within the Green Belt could be considered appropriate facilities for outdoor sport, in terms of the Framework, it is not considered that the size of facilities proposed preserves the openness of the Green Belt. As such very special circumstances are required in this case.

- 49. The very special circumstances forwarded in support of the application include:
  - The proposed stables and paddock will provide a facility not available within the area and will be of national importance for training and of international status for its' breeding capabilities.
  - The proposed stables building is to be constructed on the existing concrete slab and the siting of the paddock will require the removal of the concrete slab to the other existing building, so the harm to the nature of the land itself will be reduced.
  - The proposed infrastructure required for the breeding of horses cannot be classed as a large scale commercial equestrian centre. It falls within the requirements of outdoor sport and the size of the development proposed when weighed against the overall size of the associated land at almost 18 acres would not conflict with the use of the land within the Green Belt.
  - The proposed size of the stables is appropriate for the breeding programme and makes use of the existing concrete slab. The facilities within that building are essential to carry out the extremely high standard set by the international grading bodies required to breed horses. Equally the arena needed to train the horses up to Olympic and other international levels has to be to the size at which the horses will compete with the accuracy demanded for dressage competitions.
  - Due to the topography of the site and the contours of the surrounding area, the building would have very little impact on the openness of the Green Belt.
  - The scale of the building is paramount to provide the specialist breeding and training facilities required for the proposed development. The impact of the building on the openness of the Green Belt is no greater than the existing buildings.
  - The proposed facility at Logwood Stables will be of the highest quality and standards, providing a service that cannot be matched within the Chorley area and the region beyond. The breeding programme will be of an international standard and will promote interest from afar, bringing breeders and dressage horse owners to the Chorley area. The proposed training facility again will bring talent and business to the town with its training to the highest competitive levels.
  - If this proposal is to be classified as inappropriate development, where could this standard of development be suitably situated outside of the Green Belt with the amount of grazing land required, that would meet the requirements of the relevant animal welfare and environmental health legislations.
- 50. The proposed development is contrary to the Rural Development SPD as the development involves the erection of a large new building and does not involve development within an existing building or form part of a farm diversification scheme.
- 51. In respect of the very special circumstances forwarded in support of the application the potential benefits of locating all the facilities on one site are acknowledged however this site does not represent the most accessible or sustainable location.

- 52. The very special circumstances forwarded in support of this application state that the proposed stables and paddock will provide a facility not available within the area and will be of national importance for training and of international status for its' breeding capabilities.
- 53. However no evidence has been submitted that this facility will be of *national importance*. The supporting information states that the applicant has trained <u>potential</u> International Young Dressage Horse classes and two FEI Paralympic horses and riders<u>potentially</u> for the 2016 Paralympic Games however there is no evidence that the applicant is an internationally, regionally or locally accredited trainer.
- 54. The supporting information states that the applicant is hoping to gain a place on the World Class Pathway Scheme. The World Class Dressage Equine Pathway Programme was launched by the British Equestrian Federation (BEF) in 2007 to provide a method of identifying support, through training, for elite young horses that show an indication of the necessary qualities to represent Great Britain and ideally medal at future Championships and Olympic Games. Eligible horses will be selected on their movement, expression, trainability and potential for Championship level Grand Prix. The scheme aims to provide support to potential World Class horses through monitoring horses' development through observation and communication with the owner/rider, offering veterinary/farriery monitoring and advice at training sessions, access to training with a World Class coach, coaching advice and support together with sports science and medicine support to the rider. However no evidence has been submitted to demonstrate that any of the applicants' horses are eligible for this scheme.
- 55. It is acknowledged that the applicant runs clinics with World Class Development trainers run through British Dressage. These clinics are held at Brookfield Equestrian Centre (Windmill Lane, Brindle) with an accredited British Dressage trainer. However the applicant is not listed as an accredited trainer in the British Dressage Trainers Database or the British International Dressage Trainers Foundation.
- 56. The applicant, Mrs MacNair, has also submitted a Business Plan to support the proposals. The contents of this plan are summarised above. The Business Plan confirms that the applicant decided to set up the business once she discovered that she had a keen instinct for matching international bloodlines and producing trainable, expressive and saleable horses. The Business Plan confirms that she regularly trains with one Team GB member, Emile Faurie and also the Danish International rider, Ulrik Molgaard and refreshes her breeding knowledge by taking AI courses and management courses under Karen Raine, BHS Int. Sn (Reg), A.I Tech. Cert Ed.
- 57. The Business Plan confirms that what is needed includes converting the existing barn and replacing the other barn however as addressed earlier there are no existing barns to be converted or replaced. The proposals involve new development. The business Plan confirms that the business currently involves investing in young horses and training them to as high a standard as possible before selling on at profit to invest in horses with the potential to go even further. The initial plan is to turnover young horses at weaning and potentially backed for under £10,000 in a bid to have their young stock out in the market competing on a regular basis generating interest and activity as the business initially develops.
- 58. The aspirations of the applicant are acknowledged however it is not considered that sufficient evidence has been submitted to demonstrate that the breeding programme will be of an international standard or that the proposed training facility will involve training to the highest

competitive levels as asserted by the applicants. The business plan indicates that due to the infancy of the business the applicant is not currently in a position to train horses of an international standard although it is clear that this would be a future aspiration.

- 59. The Business Plan sites the potential competition for the business and includes *sports horse studs such as Country Farm Stud Limited in Preston (who we currently work alongside) and Holden Fold Stud in Blackburn.* The owner of Holden Fold Stud however disputes inclusions within the supporting statements as set out above.
- 60. In respect of the proposed breeding part of the enterprise it is understood that onsite supervision 24 hours a day is required and stallion and foaling boxes need to be purpose build units of 4.26m x 4.26m with CCTV cameras (linked to the property). However it is not clear why such a large building is required when standard timber stable blocks, similar to those currently on site, would provide the same facility.
- 61. Whilst dressage falls within the definition of sport, the breeding and training of dressage horses does not and falls within the sui generis use class. It has not been demonstrated that very special circumstances exist to justify the harm to the Green Belt as a result of new development within this location.

#### Traffic and Transport

- 62. In respect of the traffic generation of the proposed development the supporting information states:
  - The proposed traffic movements required for the proposed development would be reduced significantly due to the activities of the facility being based at one site. As all the needs for the horses could be met for breeding and training requirements on site, the movements relating to the transportation of the horses would be kept to a minimum.
  - The specialist nature of the breeding and training facility is far removed from the typical livery use which would generate a significantly greater volume of visitor traffic to and from the site on a daily basis.
  - Below is a schedule of the anticipated vehicle movements regarding the traffic requirements of the proposed facilities:
    - Staff estimated at 2 movements per day.
    - Horse box/ transporter 2 movements per day for attending competitions, estimated at 2 times per week during main competition periods. Also attendance at clinics (training sessions) estimated at 2 per month.
    - Vet 1 scheduled visit per month form Chorley based practice
    - Farrier 1 visit per eight weeks from Chorley based farrier.
    - Team GB physio 1 scheduled visit every eight to ten weeks.
    - Feed delivery 1 visit per month with max. 7.5 tonne vehicle from a Croston based company.
  - This volume of traffic movements would be fewer than current levels as presently the horses have to be moved from site to provide the necessary needs associated with their breeding and training that would be carried out at Logwood Stables should the application be approved.
  - Currently mares have to be scanned and inseminated at Country Farm Stud Ltd, a Preston based stud. At peak fertility this can involve transporting the mare to Gillivervet every 4 hours over a 48 hour period. With the approval of this application these treatments

would be carried out at Logwood Stables, further reducing the existing use of the lane considerably as the vet will only be needed once the mare is inseminated.

- The anticipated horse transporter movements typically is 2no per day only when the applicant's horse is competing.
- The only traffic movements being generated would be the horse transporter to deliver the horse and collect at the end of the breeding programme. The movements associated with the breeding programme could be accommodated within the 2no per day movements. It should also be taken into account that horse breeding activities are permitted development.
- 63. At the time of writing this report the highway engineers comments had not yet been received, these will reported on the addendum. It is noted that concerns have been raised by objectors in respect of traffic generation and that a number of the supporters do not consider that this would be an issue. The estimated traffic movements provided within the supporting information do appear relatively low however the Highway Engineer will comment further on this.
- 64. Concerns have been raised about 'policing' the uses on the site. Whilst the proposals do not incorporate a typical livery use it is acknowledged that a typical livery would generate traffic to and from the site. Ensuring that this situation could not occur without a further planning application could be controlled by condition.
- 65. One concern which was identified by the highway engineer on previous applications was the lack of vehicle passing points between Trigg Lane and Logwood Stables. This lane is 160m long to the entrance to Logwood Stables and involves passing by Logwood Mill Farm. The agent for the application considers that this could be overcome by the reinstatement of the alternative access into Logwood Stables. The alternative entrance to Logwood Stables is 45m from Trigg Lane with adequate visibility to this point from Trigg Lane and Logwood Mill Farm. The supporting information states that should agreement be reached to remove the post and rail fence blocking this entrance, then this would remove the problem of vehicles unable to pass having to reverse. This is however a private issue with the neighbouring property owner and reinstatement of this entrance cannot be secured via this application. Additionally a letter has been submitted from Napthans Solicitors on behalf of the neighbours which confirms that there is no alternative legal access and that their clients will not entertain any further discussion regarding an alternative right of way.
- 66. Comments on the suitability of the lane for access to the site based upon the above traffic movements is awaited from the Highway Engineer at LCC and will be reported on the addendum.

#### Parking

- 67. The proposals include parking provision as part of the development of the site. The objections on behalf of the neighbours queries this element of the proposals stating that It is difficult to ascertain what is existing lawful development and what is existing unlawful development.
- 68. There has been various works undertaken at the site, which are subject to application 13/00035/FUL, without planning consent and include the laying of hardstanding. The proposed site layout plan submitted with this application details two vehicles parking areas within the southern part of the site. One of the proposed areas is currently used as a

temporary enclosure for horses and the other has already been created as a hardstanding area which is currently used for parking (as such this part of the proposals is retrospective).

- 69. The laying of hardstanding for parking within the Green Belt is not appropriate development and can impact on the character of this rural area. It is acknowledged that if the business was established on this site and all of the facilities located on one site as proposed then an element of parking may be considered justified to facilitate the main proposals. However as addressed elsewhere it is not considered that sufficient justification has been provided in respect of the proposals and as such the provision of parking is also inappropriate development within the green belt.
- 70. In respect of the level of parking proposed the Highway Engineer will comment on the acceptability of this provision.

### Public Right of Way

- 71. There are public rights of way which run through the site. Works have been previously undertaken to these footpaths which require planning permission, this is being addressed in the other planning application.
- 72. The Ramblers Countryside Officer considers that footpaths numbers 3, 19 and 21 are adversely affected by this development due to the movement of horses, vehicle movements and the size of vehicles using the surrounding roads.
- 73. Footpath 3 runs along Brinscall Mill Road (which serves the site from Chapel Lane), footpath 19 runs from Brinscall Mill Road along the private access road which serves the application site and footpath 21 connects with footpath 19 and serves the fields within the applicants ownership.
- 74. No alterations are proposed to the route of these footpaths however improvement works are proposed to footpaths 19 and 21 which are addressed in the other planning application.
- 75. The Countryside Officers concerns are noted and the Highway Engineer's comments will be reported on the addendum.

#### <u>Design</u>

- 76. The proposed stables building will be 45m x 14m constructed on the existing slab. The slab level is 153.56m, with the ridge height to be 4.4m (157.96m). The proposed riding arena is 60m x 20m with the paddock level to be 151.66m, to match the existing slab level.
- 77. The walls of the stables building will be profiled cladding sheeting built off a steel portal frame structure, above blockwork dwarf walls. The roof to the stables will be profiled cladding sheets with a steel portal frame.
- 78. The proposed layout of the stables, internally within the building, is to have the blocks back to back with a corridor to the external wall on both sides of the building. The supporting information states that this layout arrangement is recommended by stud specialists as the stallions should not be stabled within view of the mares or be led past them. This is supported by a letter from Country Farm Stud Ltd which states this is the only sensible option for stallions and mares to be housed in one building.

- 79. The Rural Development SPD states that traditional designs will generally be the most appropriate clad externally in timber and with an internal timber frame, with a maximum ridge height of 3.5 metres for stables. Tack rooms and hay stores should be part of the same building, and each should be of a similar size to an individual stable. The proposed development does not represent traditional stabling design.
- 80. The standard size of a riding arena usually associated with a block of stables or livery yard is 40m x 20m. A larger size arena is required by the applicant as British Dressage competitions take place within a 60m x 20m arena. The British Dressage standard size arena is usually 40 metres by 20 metres for prelim and novice tests and 20 metres by 60 metres for advanced novice and grand prix competitions. The applicants contend that the horse will be trained to perform the dressage tests to an exacting standard, therefore training the horse in a smaller arena to carry out advanced moves such as Zig Zag half passes would be unfit for purpose. The supporting information states that the use of 40x20m arenas can prove detrimental to the development of the horse and the short arena tests are potentially being phased out of British Dressage as both Regional and National Championships run the long arena tests.
- 81. The Rural Development SPD states that sand paddocks should be of the minimum size necessary and should not encroach on the open countryside. Sand paddocks should utilise existing ground levels unless absolutely necessary and should not appear built out of the ground and thus alien to the natural contours of the land. The proposed riding arena utilises the existing land level on site and the size reflects the aspirations of the applicant in respect of training horses, notwithstanding the appropriateness of this facility which is addressed above.

#### Lighting and Noise

- 82. The application includes the erection of six 6 metre high lighting columns around the proposed riding arena and security lights. The Rural Development SPD confirms that floodlighting of sand paddocks and yards is generally inappropriate in the open countryside or near to neighbouring residents. No justification has been provided in respect of the need for the proposed lighting columns or details of the specification. The SPD states that where floodlighting is proposed, it should be designed to minimise light spillage from the lit area. However without justification for the lighting columns or security lights and/ or specification details it is not considered that this element of the proposals is acceptable.
- 83. Dressage must be set to a musical score and as such the training will also involve elements of training to music. As the proposed training arena is an open arena the projection of music has the potential to adversely impact on the neighbours' amenities and the character of the area. However no information in respect of this element of the enterprise has been submitted with the application. Restricting noise levels and potential impacts could be controlled by condition.

#### <u>Ecology</u>

- 84. Lancashire County Council Ecology have not been consulted on this application. However they have previously advised that the application area appears to be of relatively low biodiversity value, and significant impacts therefore appear reasonably unlikely.
- 85. Habitats on site, including buildings are suitable to support nesting birds. Therefore tree felling, vegetation clearance works, demolition work or other works that may affect nesting birds should be avoided between March and July inclusive, unless the absence of nesting

birds has been confirmed by further surveys or inspections. This can be secured via informative.

86. The Ecologist has previously commented that although the proposals might not result in any significant impacts, planning policy does stress the need to not only maintain but also enhance biodiversity as part of planning proposals. It would therefore be appropriate for the applicant to consider implementing measures for the benefit of wildlife. For example, bird nesting opportunities could be incorporated or nest boxes could be erected on suitable trees; existing hedgerows could be gapped up with locally appropriate native species; new mixed species native hedgerows could be created; hedgerows should ideally be managed to maximise wildlife benefit (encouraged to grow tall, wide and dense; cut on rotation only); hedgerow bases and watercourses should be protected from livestock grazing, etc. This can be secured by a suitable landscaping condition.

#### Sustainability

- 87. Policy 27 of the Adopted Central Lancashire Core Strategy states that minimum energy efficiency standards for new buildings will be 'Very Good' according to the Building Research Establishment's Environmental Assessment Method (BREEAM).
- 88. Subject to other planning policies, planning permission for non-residential units of 500 sq metres or more floorspace where all of the following criteria are satisfied:
  - a. Evidence is set out to demonstrate that the design, orientation and layout of the building minimises energy use, maximises energy efficiency and is flexible enough to withstand climate change;
  - b. Prior to the implementation of zero carbon building through the Code for Sustainable Homes for dwellings or BREEAM for other buildings, either additional building fabric insulation measures,

Or appropriate decentralised, renewable or low carbon energy sources are installed and implemented to reduce the carbon dioxide emissions of predicted energy use by at least 15%;

- a. Appropriate storage space is to be provided for recyclable waste materials and composting;
- b. If the proposed development lies within a nationally designated area, such as a Conservation Area or affects a Listed Building, it will be expected to satisfy the requirements of the policy through sensitive design unless it can be demonstrated that complying with the criteria in the policy, and the specific requirements applying to the Code for Sustainable Homes and BREEAM, would have an unacceptable adverse effect on the character or appearance of the historic or natural environment.
- 89. As the proposed building exceeds 500m<sup>2</sup> both parts of the Policy will need to be satisfied in respect of the proposals. The applicants do not demonstrate how this would be achieved within the submission however appropriately worded conditions could secure the requirements.

#### **Overall Conclusion**

90. The consideration of this application is a balanced consideration as there are both positive and negative issues relating to the proposals. These are summarised below:

Positive Elements	Negative Elements
	The development involves the erection of a new building within the Green Belt. It is acknowledged that the previous buildings on site had a volume of 4,850 m <sup>3</sup> and the volume proposed (2,331m <sup>3</sup> ) is approximately half of this however these buildings were removed from the site and this proposal results in the erection of a new building and riding arena which will impact on the openness of the Green Belt.
The business would assist in producing British breed dressage horses and reduce reliance on foreign owned/ loaned dressage horses	No evidence has been provided that the horses breed at this facility would achieve national/ international status. No supporting statements have been submitted from either accredited trainers or British Dressage to support the applicants assertions.
The enterprise would provide an element of employment	The employment provision would not be significant with only 1 full time member of staff and 2 part time and it does not appear that this would create new employment as people are already employed at the site.
The proposals will enable the consolidation of the breeding and training facilities on one site. The current breeding and training programme is carried out at various stables around the country and the proposals would bring the training element into Chorley	
The commercial benefits of the scheme involve supporting innovation and supporting a new business within Chorley	
	The submission includes reference to water harvesting however there is no evidence to demonstrate that the proposals would achieve the sustainability objectives of Policy 27 of the Core Strategy

The design of the proposals does not accord with guidance set out within the Rural Development SPD and as such results in a building which has a greater impact on the rural character of the area.
There is no information regarding lighting or noise to enable an assessment of any potential impact

- 91. It is acknowledged that these proposals would not create a 'typical' livery use on this site nor would the applicant be training other peoples' horses which does create a unique proposal for this site. However this is balanced against the fact that the building and arena applied for are very large and will have an impact on the openness of the Green Belt.
- 92. The three dimensions to sustainable development set out within the Framework includes an economic role and states (para 7) that the planning system should contribute to building a strong, responsive and competitive economy, by ensuring that sufficient land of the right type is available in the right places and at the right time to support growth and innovation. However the breeding business is already operating from the site and can continue to do so without the proposals. As such it is not considered that the fact that the proposals will create a business constitutes a reason to outweigh green belt policy.
- 93. The applicants acknowledge that the facilities are large scale and have forwarded very special circumstances in this regard. The applicants' aspirations to create an internationally accredited stud farm and training centre are acknowledged however insufficient evidence has been forwarded which demonstrates that this would actually be achieved on this site.
- 94. Taking into consideration other similar schemes which have been approved in the Borough (paras 35-37) these do represent large facilities however the very special circumstances forwarded in support of those applications were considered to outweigh the harm on the Green Belt. Lower House Farm is located close to the application site and utilises part of the same access road however the development here represented a traditional stable block building and standard sand paddock and was considered to be acceptable when it was assessed 19 years ago.
- 95. The design of the building is not a traditional stable construction and results in a large building which will impact on this green belt location. The proposed parking areas are not appropriate development in the Green Belt and the inclusion of lighting columns and security lights has the potential to adversely impact on the open character of the area.
- 96. It is not considered that the justification put forward in support of the application warrants very special circumstances to allow a large building, large sand paddock, parking areas and lighting within this Green Belt location.
- 97. It should also be noted that the Highway Engineer's comments on the proposals are key to the considerations of the proposals. These will be addressed on the addendum.

### **Planning History**

**00/00582/COU-** Conversion of stable to detached dwelling and erection of detached double garage. Approved September 2000

02/00717/FUL- Barn Conversion to a two storey dwelling. Withdrawn

06/00840/FUL- Proposed detached garage with hayloft above. Withdrawn

07/01057/FUL- Detached garage. Approved November 2007

**11/00384/FUL-** Erection of an equestrian facility comprising new stables, tack rooms and storage. Creation of open dressage arena, horse walker and associated parking areas. Application for land leveling and laying of hardstanding for access tracks (retrospective). Withdrawn

**11/01103/FUL-** Erection of an equestrian facility comprising new stables, tack rooms and storage. Creation of open dressage arena, horse walker and associated parking areas. Application for land levelling and laying of hardstanding for access tracks (retrospective).(Resubmission of application No 11/00384/FUL.) Withdrawn

13/00035/FUL- Retrospective application for:

1) Engineering works including the formation of tracks and roadways within the site, works to form pond, repairs to drainage ditch and repairs to the public footpath.

2) Erection of stables on the site for a temporary period

Pending Consideration (on this DC Committee Agenda)

#### Logwood Mill Farm:

78/00760/FUL- Septic tank. Approved October 1978

87/00601/FUL- Barn conversion. Approved November 1987

**89/00799/FUL-** Extension to living accommodation into redundant farm building. Approved January 1990

03/00207/FUL- Erection of stable block. Refused April 2003

03/00755/FUL- Erection of stable block and tractor store. Approved September 2003

09/00416/FUL- Two storey rear extension. Approved July 2009

**09/00844/MNMA-** Non material amendment to approved two storey extension (Application No 09/00416/FUL). Withdrawn

**09/00991/FUL-** Erection of two storey rear extension (amendment to planning approval 09/00416/FUL). Approved February 2010

10/00582/FUL- Extension to existing front porch. Approved October 2010

Recommendation: Refuse Full Planning Permission Reasons

1. The proposed development, by virtue of their size, design, scale, materials and proposed parking areas, does not constitute appropriate development within the

Green Belt and it is not considered that very special circumstances have not been forwarded which demonstrate that the harm the proposals will have on the openness of the Green Belt is outweighed by other considerations. As such the proposals are contrary to guidance contained with the National Planning Policy Framework, Policies DC1 and EP8 of the Adopted Chorley Borough Local Plan Review and the Rural Development SPD.

2. The application is not accompanied by sufficient information to demonstrate that the proposed lighting columns and security lights would not be detrimental to the open rural character and appearance of the Green Belt. As such the proposed columns and lights are contrary to guidance contained with the National Planning Policy Framework, Policies DC1 and EP8 of the Adopted Chorley Borough Local Plan Review and the Rural Development SPD.